

Capacity Market Technical Conference

**Federal Energy Regulatory
Commission
May 7, 2008**

**Robert M. Loughney
Couch White, LLP**

Background

- Partner with Couch White, LLP
- Couch White Represents Large Commercial, Institutional, and Industrial Consumers in New York and Connecticut
 - Multiple Intervenors in New York – an Association of 52 Large Energy Users
 - Connecticut Industrial Energy Consumers in Connecticut – an Association of 8 Large Energy Users

Capacity Pricing Has Been A Recurring Problem in New York

- In 2003, the Demand Curve Was Adopted
 - Very Contentious Debate; Closest Vote Ever At NYISO Management Committee
- The Demand Curve Depends on An Administratively-Determined Capacity Price
 - Independent Consultant Calculates the Price of a Theoretical New Peaker
 - Stakeholders Have Significant Input on the Calculation
 - Three Demand Curves Are Developed

Demand Curve Re-Set Process

- Demand Curves Are Re-Set Once Every Three Years
- Demand Curve Process is Highly Contentious; Many Assumptions About Demands, Construction Costs and Prices
- Demand Curves Are Presented to the NYISO Board, Which Has the Ability to Adjust the Values Based on Stakeholder Comments
- Demand Curves Are Filed With FERC, Which Reviews Them
- There is No Review of Actual Costs By Any Regulatory Body

Recent Demand Curve Decision

- On January 29, 2008, FERC Approved, Without Modification, the New NYISO Demand Curves, Effective May 1, 2008
- Rest of State (“ROS”) Proxy Net Peaker Cost Set at \$83.00/kW/yr.
 - Current ROS Demand Curve Based on a \$74.09/kW/yr. Net Peaker Cost

Forward Capacity Market in New York

- FCM Issues Under Examination in NYISO ICAP WG
- No Timeline for Completion; Discussion Still at Preliminary Stages
- New York Consumers Are Watching FCM Auction Results in PJM and ISO-NE With Great Apprehension

Energy and Ancillary Services Prices Remain High

- Statewide Average Price Was \$80.29/MWH in 2007
 - More Than \$90.00/MWH in January – March, 2008
- Prices Increase Steadily from West to East
 - Capital Region (Albany) Spikes – Zone Averages 20-25% Higher Than Western Region (Buffalo)
- Natural Gas Clears the Market A Great Deal of the Time
 - Hydro, Coal and Nuclear Plant Owners Are Big Winners
 - However, Fuel Not Sole Indicator of Price Increases

Market Reevaluation

- Multiple Intervenors and CIEC Support Efforts Requesting that FERC Reevaluate Market Design Principles
- Energy Market Prices Do Not Reflect Marginal Costs
 - Non-Gas Generators Reap Tremendous Economic Benefits
- Capacity Markets Are Not Spurring Investment
 - Only Major New Plant Proposals Driven By Long-Term Contracts with Load Serving Entities

End-User Concerns

- End Users Are Concerned with the Economic Disparity Caused By High Rates in Deregulated Markets
 - New York and Connecticut Rank 1st and 2nd for Highest Rates in Continental U.S.
 - The Gap Between Rates in Restructured States Such as New York and Connecticut and Regulated States Keeps Growing; Disparity Not Just Fuel Related
 - Competition for Manufactured Goods Will Force Jobs Out of Higher-Priced States to Lower-Priced States and Countries

End User Concerns

- End Users Also Are Concerned With Reliability
- The Demand Curves in New York Are Not Spawning New Generation Proposals
 - Given Short-Term Nature, They May Never Result in New Generation
 - Only Long-Term Contracts Seem to Provide Needed Certainty for Investors
 - Result: The Demand Curves Are Just Another Revenue Stream for Existing Generators

Alternative Market Design Proposals

- Multiple Intervenors and CIEC Supported the Portland Cement Alternative Market Design
- Procurement Process Should Identify and Dispatch Units that Result in the Lowest Total (Capacity and Energy) Costs for Consumers
 - Willing to Work Out Details
 - FERC Should Take Lead Role

Demand Resources

- Demand Resources Are Critical to Efficient Markets and Should Not Be Disadvantaged By Market Changes
- Demand Resources Should Be Allowed to Compete in Capacity, Energy and Ancillary Services Markets on an Equal Footing With Generators

Wrap-Up

- **Questions?**

Robert M. Loughney
Couch White, LLP
(518) 320-3404

rloughney@couchwhite.com